

POLICE ADVISORY AND REVIEW COMMITTEE MINUTES

Chairperson Rosa Mar called the meeting to order at 6:00 p.m. on October 25, 2018 at the South Knoxville Community Center, 522 Maryville Pike, Knoxville, Tennessee.

Attending Committee: Rosa Mar, Robert Gibson, Ann Barker, LaKenya Middlebrook

Not Attending: Frank Shanklin, Robbie Arrington, Jered Croom

Attending PARC Staff: Clarence L. Vaughn, III, PARC Executive Director, Ola Blackmon-McBride Executive Assistant

Attending KPD/City of Knoxville Staff: Chief Eve Thomas, Captain Anthony Willis, Lieutenant Kyle Bush, Sergeant Jonathan Chadwell, Sergeant Amanda Bunch, Officer John Morgan, Officer Don Zerillo, Attorney Ronald Mills, Deborah Thomas, & Avice Reid, Sr. Director of Community Relations

INTRODUCTION

Chairperson Rosa Mar provided thanked to the South Knoxville Community Center under the leadership of Mrs. Debbie Beeler for hosting the 3rd Quarter PARC Meeting.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

Chairperson Mar asked if committee members had reviewed the 2nd Quarter minutes from the July 19, 2018 meeting. There were no changes. The 2nd Quarter meeting minutes were approved.

SPEAKING ENGAGEMENTS & EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPORT – Clarence Vaughn

Executive Director Vaughn gave a combined report of the third quarter speaking engagements and Executive Director's report.

SPEAKING ENGAGEMENTS

- July 6, 2018** The Executive Director was asked to serve as a guest speaker for the “Arc of Knox”, which is a nonprofit organization that is committed to providing programs and services for individuals with intellectual disabilities in the Knox County area. The discussion was directed to PARC’s history, background, and services rendered.
- July 10, 2018** The Executive Director shared information about PARC’s history and service to the City of Knoxville at the Knoxville Real Estate Investor Association meeting. Meeting participants discussed concerns about public safety and crime, and they were provided with information about PARC and its focused efforts on keeping Knoxville safe and welcoming to all community members.
- July 21, 2018** The Executive Director served as a guest on the “Hubert Smith Radio Show”, in which he discussed information regarding the history of PARC and civilian oversight in the City of Knoxville. The discussion involved providing effective ways in which relationships between community members and law enforcement officers can be improved.
- August 7, 2018** The Executive Director served as a guest speaker for the Downtown Knoxville Rotary Club meeting. The discussion involved the formation of PARC and various models of Civilian Oversight. Meeting participants also received information about the history of Civilian Oversight and its service on a national level.
- August 13, 2018** The Executive Director lead a training session for the Knoxville Police Department Recruit Class on Civilian Oversight and services rendered by PARC. Recruits were provided with an historical background of key issues which caused for the creation of PARC. In addition, the recruits were encouraged to serve as advocates and assist PARC in its efforts to improve relationships amongst community members and law enforcement officers.
- August 30, 2018** The Executive Director served as a guest speaker for the Kiwanis Club of Knoxville. The Executive Director provided an overview of PARC and its service to the City of Knoxville. In addition, meeting participants were provided with background information about Civilian Oversight and ways in which they can serve as citizen advocates.
- September 10, 2018** The Executive Director was asked to lead a discussion on a book titled, “Bluebird, Bluebird” written by Attica Locke. The book referenced the life of an African-American Texas Ranger and the hardships faced with being a law enforcement officer in a rural community. The discussion further addressed issues related to biases within law enforcement and issues related to race and discrimination.
- September 21, 2018** The Executive Director served as the master of ceremony at the 20th Anniversary program recognizing PARC. The program consisted of individuals whom played a vital role in the creation and success of PARC. There were comments made from each guest speaker about the importance of community members remaining engaged and supportive of PARC efforts to improve relationships between the community and the Knoxville Police Department.

Attendees were reminded everyone that if anyone would like PARC to speak to his or her organization, please call Clarence Vaughn at the PARC office. The PARC office telephone number is 865-215-3869 and it can also be found in the Informational Brochure located at the entrance table.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPORT

AUDITS OF KPD POLICIES AND PROCEDURES

Reviewed the following ordinances, policies, and procedures as result of the Executive Director's evaluation of the Internal Affairs Investigations and complaints brought to the Executive Director:

- General Order 1.32 (Conflict of Interest)
- General Order 1.36 (Harassment)
- General Order 1.60 (Response to Resistance)
- General Order 1.41 (Bias Based Policing)
- General Order 2.16 (Digital In-Car Recording Equipment)
- General Order 3.9 (Traffic Enforcement)
- Standard Operating Procedure 1.02 (Neglect of Duty)
- Standard Operating Procedure 1.19 (Unbecoming Conduct)
- Standard Operating Procedure 1.23 (Dissemination of Information)
- Standard Operating Procedure 1.24 (Use of Force)
- Standard Operating Procedure 2.04 (Conduct – General)
- Standard Operating Procedure 2.07 (Truthfulness)

ADVOCACY (STRENGTHENING THE RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN THE CITIZENS AND THE KPD)

- The Executive Director continues to meet with Knoxville Police Department's Command Staff and Internal Affairs Unit on a regular basis to discuss concerns and best practices that will result in effective ways to improve relationships with community members.
- The Executive Director lead a training discussion for the Knoxville Police Department Recruit Class on the history of Civilian Oversight and PARC's service to the City of Knoxville. In addition, information was shared in regards to ways in which KPD officers can aid PARC in our shared goals of promoting public safety and improved relationships between law enforcement officers and community members.
- The Executive Director schedules introductory meetings for PARC interns with the Knoxville Police Department, Tennessee Bureau of Investigation, Federal Bureau of Investigation, Knox County District Attorney's Office, and Knox County Public Defender's Office. Interns are afforded with an opportunity to learn more about their fields of interest and ask questions to leaders in the field of law enforcement.

COMMUNITY OUTREACH

- The Executive Director continues to meet with citizens and community groups to discuss concerns and complaints to develop plans for helpful resolutions.
- The Executive Director has served as a presenter during the "Mayor's Summer Internship", which affords high school and collegiate students with an opportunity to work alongside various departments within City government. The discussion topic is on personal development and ways in which students can better prepare themselves for unforeseen challenges.
- The Executive Director serves on several boards and community groups that are focused on ensuring that community members of Knoxville receive adequate health care, financial resources, and safety. In addition, the community groups direct attention to aiding community members whom were recently incarcerated and in need of services.

NETWORKING

- The Executive Director was contacted by the City of Nashville in reference to PARC. The Executive Director shared information about the formation of PARC and its service to the City of Knoxville. The Executive Director also provided data and resources to assist Nashville in their efforts to learn more about Civilian Oversight.
- The Executive Director took part in a Community Building Workshop hosted by the Community Building Institute. The workshop comprised of community members from various backgrounds working together to identify ways to enhance relationships and improve their respective communities.
- The Executive Director attends community-lead events to share information about PARC and its service to the City of Knoxville. The Executive Director attended Lonsdale Homecoming Celebration, where community members shared their concerns and interests of increasing public safety.

Chairperson Mar reminded everyone that if they wished to speak at the meeting tonight during “Open Forum” to please sign up on the green sheet located at the sign-in table.

PARC SUBCOMMITTEE REPORTS

Audio/Video Subcommittee – Ann Barker

Of the (3) IAU Cases and (1) Referral Action Form reviewed by PARC Audio/Video Subcommittee in the 3rd Quarter, we submit the provided findings:

File #1 IAU Case #18-2795
The officer’s dashboard camera and audio equipment operated properly. The reviewed Internal Affairs Unit case involved dispatch recordings and in-car audio relating to the officer’s involvement in the incident. The reviewed audio and visual recordings provided further detail into the initial complaint received.

File #2 IAU Case #18-2797
During the incident, the officers involved in the Internal Affairs Unit case were noted for usage of their dashboard camera and wireless microphone. However, an officer was identified as failing to properly activate their wireless microphone while the involved party was being questioned. The questioning was captured on another officer’s wireless microphone.

File #3 IAU Case #18-2792
The officer whom initially answered the traffic stop failed to properly activate their wireless microphone. The officer initiated the traffic stop at 9:31am and did not activate their wireless microphone until 10:09am. The officer was noted as failing to abide by the Knoxville Police Department’s General Order 2.16 (Digital In-Car Recording Equipment).

File #4 Referral Action Form
The incident reviewed confirmed that the officer properly activated their wireless microphone and dashboard camera during their interaction with the involved party and complainant.

SUMMARY

The Knoxville Police Department’s General Order 2.16 (Digital In-Car Recording Equipment) details that Officers shall turn on their audio and video equipment when they are out of their patrol unit on a call-for-service in the event audio is needed to substantiate or assist with documentation of their law enforcement duties, i.e., domestic disturbance, etc. It should be remembered that the purpose of the in-car video equipment is to monitor all contacts with a person in the community in all situations possible. We would also like to mention that the Knoxville Police Department requires Sergeants to review officers’ audio and visual footage twice per month to ensure that their wireless microphones are operating properly.

RACIAL PROFILING SUBCOMMITTEE – LaKenya Middlebrook

There was one alleged racial profiling case received by PARC during the 3rd Quarter.

Case #1 Summary:

PARC received a citizen complaint in reference to a traffic stop that took place on August 10th, 2018, involving an officer of the Knoxville Police Department. The complainant was driving in a school zone near Green Magnet School, and he was stopped for driving 36mph in a 20mph zone. The complainant alleged that other vehicles were traveling at the same rate of speed, yet his vehicle was targeted by the officer. The complainant felt as though he was racially profiled due to the type of vehicle he was driving and the information stated on his front license plate (Black/Proud/Educated). The complaint is directed to the officer’s questioning in regards to the complainant’s ownership of his vehicle, a 2013 Toyota Tundra pickup truck. The complainant stated that he was asked on more than one occasion if he was the owner of the vehicle, yet he stated that the officer did not request to view the vehicle registration. The complainant provided his driver’s license and proof of insurance to the officer, and he received a citation for speeding in an identified school zone.

Conclusion:

The information presented by the complainant involved an alleged case of racial profiling by a Knoxville Police Department officer. After further review of the issued citation, the conclusion resulted in the officer’s actions being in accordance with the Knoxville Police Department’s policy and procedure. The notion of Bias Based Policing and Racial Profiling are very serious allegations, yet the involved officer was not identified as showcasing signs of blatant bias or racial undertones towards the complainant. Therefore, the allegations against the involved officer did not support a violation of the Knoxville Police Department’s *General Order 1.41 (Bias Based Policing)*.

KPD Policy and Procedure Reviewed:

General Order 1.41 Bias Based Policing

I. Policy

It is the policy of the Knoxville Police Department that we are committed to preserving the peace and maintaining order in the City of Knoxville by practicing bias-free policing and respecting the rights and dignity of all citizens.

II. Definition

Bias Based Profiling - The practice of stopping, detaining or searching a person based solely upon a common trait or a group that includes but is not limited to their race, color ethnicity, age, gender sexual orientation, religion, economic status or any other identifiable group characteristic.

Operations Subcommittee – Robert Gibson

Mr. Robert Gibson reported on the quarterly totals of the 2018 cases, received, and reviewed by the Police Advisory and Review Committee, covering the period July 1, 2018 through September 30, 2018.

| | |
|--|----|
| Total Cases for the Quarter | 23 |
| Cases Closed in the Quarter | 21 |
| Resolution of Cases Closed for the Quarter | |
| Executive Director | 14 |
| Mediation: Executive Director & KPD | 0 |
| Referrals to Appropriate Agencies | 4 |
| KPD | 3 |
| Executive Assistant | 0 |
| Executive Assistant & KPD | 0 |
| Total Cases Pending for the Quarter | |
| 2 | |
| PARC <i>Initiated</i> Cases Referred to IAU for the Quarter | 0 |
| IAU Completed Cases Reviewed by PARC for the Quarter | 3 |
| IAU Referral Action Forms Reviewed by PARC for the Quarter | 1 |
| PARC <i>Initiated</i> Cases sent to IAU | 0 |
| IAU <i>Initiated</i> Referrals and Cases | 0 |

Mr. Robert Gibson reported on the year to date totals on cases reviewed by the Police Advisory and Review Committee, covering the period of January 1, 2018 through September 30, 2018

| | |
|---|-----|
| Total Cases for the Year | 64 |
| Cases Closed for the Year | 63* |
| Resolution of Cases Closed for the Year | |
| Executive Director | 38 |
| Mediation: Executive Director & KPD | 2 |
| Referrals to Appropriate Agencies | 9 |
| KPD | 14 |
| Total Cases Resolved | 63* |
| Total Cases Pending | |
| 3 | |
| PARC <i>Initiated</i> Cases Referred to IAU for the Year | 4 |
| IAU Completed Cases Reviewed by PARC for the Year | 9 |
| IAU Completed Referral Action Forms Reviewed by PARC | 3 |
| IAU <i>Initiated</i> Referrals and Cases | 0 |

*Indicates that 2 cases from 2017 have been closed in the current year

PARC TRAINING SESSION: 20th ANNIVERSARY OF PARC HIGHLIGHTS – Clarence L. Vaughn III

Executive Director Clarence Vaughn provided highlights of PARC’s 20th anniversary celebration held on September 21, 2018.

CASE MATTERS TO BE ADDRESSED BY THE COMMITTEE

There were no cases to be addressed.

CITIZENS ASKED TO APPEAR BEFORE PARC

Yvonne Stephens: Ms. Stephens expressed thanks to Chief Eve Thomas and Deputy Chief Ron Green for supporting a youth activity at her church. Their attendance at this event was uplifting to the children.

David Hayes: Mr. Hayes shared an experience he encountered with law enforcement at a recent political event.

OPEN FORUM

Alontro Simpson – Mr. Sims requested clarification on “What constitutes an officer asking for ID?” Chief Thomas responded to his question.

Dotty Darst – Ms. Darst expressed concerns about speeding in school zones in her community. Chief Thomas requested she speak with them after the meeting to obtain additional information.

COMMUNITY UPDATES

Rebecca Par thanked Chief Eve Thomas for supporting the “National Night Out.”

The meeting adjourned

Respectfully Submitted,
Clarence L. Vaughn III, Executive Director